MINUTES

GREATER NAPLES FIRE RESCUE DISTRICT BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS MEETING

June 9, 2015

Meeting Opened

Chairman Page called to order the regular meeting of the Greater Naples Fire Rescue District's Board of Fire Commissioners at 5:30 PM on June 9, 2015 at Administrative Headquarters. Present were Chairman Page, Commissioners Boyer, Cottiers, Cross Gerrity, Hemping, McMahon and Stedman. Executive staff in attendance: Chief Schuldt, Assistant Chief Sapp, Deputy Chief Biondo, Fire Marshal Hanson and Deputy Director Bishop. Staff in attendance: Michele Packard, Nicole Chesser, Shar Hingson, Daniel Sawyer and family and Jarett Cotter. Members of the public included; Jim Burke, Orly Stolts, Alan McLaughlin, George Danz, Jim Horner, Walter Kopka, Tony Grau, Mike Ramsey and Wayne Martin. Others were in attendance but did not sign in.

A. Pledge of Allegiance and Invocation

Chairman Page opened the meeting with the Pledge of Allegiance followed by the invocation by Commissioner Gerrity.

B. Line of Duty Deaths Reading and Moment of Silence

Chief Schuldt reported that there were a total of 9 FF fatalities for the month of May, bringing the total for 2015 to 38 followed by a moment of silence.

Additions and Deletions to the Agenda

Director Bishop informed the Board of a revision to I.E. board minutes from the May 12, 2015 meeting, a handout for I.F.2., Fire Code's Treasurer Report and a handout for I.F.3., Operations Report. Additional handouts/replacements included draft 2 of FCO Resolution 2015-10 under II.B.2., and draft 2 of Resolution 2015-09 for III.D.

Director Bishop requested an Executive Session on behalf of staff. Approval of the Agenda

Commissioner Hemping moved to approve the amended agenda. Commissioner Boyer seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0.

D. Approval of the GNFD Board Minutes for May 12, 2015

Commissioner Boyer stated that the amended minutes under I. were close to what was said (there was no recording due to a malfunction) but when Commissioner Boyer had asked the auditor if there were savings, the auditor said no. Commissioner Stedman disagreed with that statement along with Commissioner Gerrity. Commissioner Cross stated that the auditor said that looking for cost savings is not something he was tasked to do. Commissioner Boyer added that this might be something to ask of the auditor in the future. Also mentioned from Commissioner Boyer was the fact that there are issues with the meeting recordings and it needs to be addressed. Chairman Page recommended that Commissioner Boyer bring up the topic under Commissioner Comments for further discussion.

Commissioner Cross moved to approve the revised board minutes for the May 12, 2015 regular meeting. Cottiers seconded the motion. Motion passed 7-1, with Commissioner Boyer opposed.

E. Consent Agenda

C.

Commissioner Gerrity moved to approve the consent agenda as presented. Commissioner Hemping seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0.

- 1. Treasurer Report
- 2. FCO's Treasurer Report
- 3. Operations Report Assistant Chief Sapp
- 4. Administration and Finance Report Deputy Director Bishop
- 5. Support Services Report Deputy Chief Biondo
 - a) Fire and Life Safety Report Division Chief Hanson
 - b) Fleet Report
 - c) Logistics
- 6. At-A-Boys
 - a) VeronaWalk CERT Team Thank You Acting Lt. Jarett Cotter

F. Awards and Recognition:

- 1. 15 Year Service Awards Lieutenant Todd Nugent, Driver Engineer John Winslow, & Firefighter David Perez Not in attendance.
- 5 Year Service Award Chief Schuldt
 Chairman Page presented Chief Schuldt with his 5 year service award.

MINUTES

GREATER NAPLES FIRE RESCUE DISTRICT BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS MEETING June 9, 2015

- Collier County Proclamation Fire Marshal Shawn Hanson
 Chief Schuldt, A/C Sapp and Chief Biondo recognized and congratulated Shawn Hanson for the
 Collier County Proclamation she received on May 26, 2015.
- 4. State Fire Service Awards Fire Marshal Shawn Hanson
 Chief Schuldt, A/C Sapp and Chief Biondo recognized and congratulated Chief Hanson on receiving the State of Florida 2014 Fire Marshal of the Year award April 13, 2015.
- 5. Eagle Awards:

Lt. Gregory Baker	DE Derek Jones	LT Jeff Roll	
FF David Borowski	FF Tyler McCarthy	DE Christopher Rossi	
LT Brandon Bunting	FF Kenny Moyer	DE Daniel Sawyer	
FF Eric Dilyard	FF Thomas Pecora	DE Timothy Sims	
LT Brian Heath	DE John Richard	LT Matt Trent	
Chief Schuldt, along with Chief Sapp and Chief Kopka (EMS), recognized and awarded			
DE Daniel Sawyer an Eagle Award certificate for life saving. (Similar to the Phoenix			
Awards the County awards) The remaining award recipients were not in attendance.			

G. Presentation of the 2013-2014 ENFD Audited Financials – Deputy Director Bishop
Tony Grau & Associates presented the ENFD audited financials along with the financials
of the Fire Code Officials Office.

The Fire Code has a clean opinion with notation of closure of the office.

Commissioner Boyer moved to accept the 2013-2014 Audit Report for the Fire Code Officials Office as submitted. Commissioner Cross seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0.

Tony Grau reviewed the ENFD financials in detail with the Board.

Commissioner Cross moved to accept the 2013-2014 Audit Report for the East Naples Fire Control and Rescue District as submitted. Commissioner Gerrity seconded. Motion passed 8-0. Commissioner Boyer asked (same question posed to the GGFD auditor last month) if there were any savings due to the merger, yes or no. Mr. Grau responded that he did not know because he would have to look at projections versus actual; very speculative to determine that. An audit insures the district is spending money in accordance with Florida Statutes, district resolutions and policies for procurement. He went on to say an audit makes sure there are proper controls in place, i.e. actually receive what the district purchases and payroll is processed and recorded properly. It is not the auditor's place to question the actions of management. Commissioner Boyer stated that he thought a separate audit looks at the financials for the State of Florida and commissioners to see how staff is doing, Commissioner Boyer cannot look at the books the way the auditor can and was hoping to know if there were any actual sayings but if you were not looking for that you cannot answer that. Mr. Grau responded saying they are not looking at it because the decision has already made; audits look at what actually happened not what might have happened if the districts stayed separate. Commissioner Stedman went on record saying that as the exact same answer from the GGFD auditor to which Chairman Page agreed and would expect; that is not something the auditor is tasked with.

H. Fire Administration - Chief Schuldt

1. Fire Chief's Board Update

Chief Schuldt's reported on the following:

- In response to Commissioner Boyer's earlier concern, all pricing and quotes have been gathered for the redesign of audio-visual system which should be handled within the next few weeks as this is a very important item to the Board.
- At the NFPA Fire Sprinkler Summit there is a real push for residential fire sprinklers where the most civilian and firefighter fatalities occur. The Chief is working with the State Fire Marshal to bring a coalition together to support this effort.
- Back on track with the station meetings; keeping the membership updated on the activities of the organization.
- In the next 30-60 days the Strategic Plan work groups will be established to implement the four strategies identified in the plan.

- The transfer of ownership of the East Naples fire hydrants to the County became effective today at the BOCC meeting. There are still a number of hydrants behind the back flow which GNFD will always be responsible for. Staff will be bringing a plan to the Board in the near future for funding these remaining hydrants.
- The TRIM preliminary numbers are in with a 9.808% increase in taxable revenue for 2014. Anticipated ad valorem revenue is estimated to be \$21 million dollars with an increase of about \$1.8 million which means the District continues to stabilize.
- There has been significant movement of personnel. Maintenance Tech Greg Houchin separated from the District; currently advertising to fill this position. There have been offers of employment to three part time firefighters. Interviews being prepared to hire a fourth Vehicle Technician as well as a Fire Inspector.
- Chief Sapp went to the final inspection on the new Quint which should be arriving within the next three weeks. The new Air and Light truck is on the line and moving along. In looking at the long term analysis of the apparatus specifically Tower 72 which has been problematic over the years and well into its life cycle. In assessing it, there is not a lot of return on this vehicle and it may be a good idea to move this vehicle on now to get a decent dollar for it and get a vehicle more applicable to the District's situation. A preliminary assessment from a Broker shows a value of \$300,000. Commissioner Stedman stated that this piece of equipment was being used for calls other than its intended purpose and not doubt the reason it has become so problematic.

I. Chapter 175 Firefighters' Pension Plan – Chairman Arroyo

Deputy Director Bishop stated the report is as submitted; the Trustee for Seat 2, Mr. Cooper, was seated at the last meeting. The annual report was received; the investment portfolio showed an overall investment return of 4.9%. The next meeting is Friday, August 14th.

J. Local 2396 Report

Chief Schuldt reported the union leadership is away attending a conference and reported on behalf of Executive President Brian Mading that the union appreciated the efforts of staff in going through the negotiation process and that President Brian Mading spoke at the BOCC meeting today on the Collier County Fire Service Proposal. Also the union continues to meet with the Isles and Ochopee firefighters and have a very positive dialog going.

II. OLD BUSINESS

A. Emergency Services Task Force Meeting- Commissioner Hemping

Commissioner Hemping reported that the task force meets on the third Thursday of every month at GNFD Administrative Headquarters at 9:00 AM. There is still a good attendance of approximately 20 – 30 people.

Chairman Page added that Commissioner Henning commented on the great progress of this task force and plans on attending representing the County Board. Commissioner Gerrity reported that he and Commissioner Burke are trying to come up with a preliminary paper together to discuss creating a fire academy that would be mutually staffed initially by GNFD and NCFD; where everyone would be trained. Commissioner Boyer questioned whether it would be a facility in association with Edison College. Commissioner Gerrity clarified that it would be one place for all the District's suppression units to come and train the same way with the same standard procedures for everyone. Commissioner Boyer wanted to know if it would be a place to certify new firefighters to which Commissioner Gerrity responded saying that they would certify firefighters, hire from there, have a consortium with EMS for the medical training and would like to partner with Florida Southwest State College to get college credits for course taken. Commissioner McMahon asked Commissioner Hemping if there were minutes he could get since he is unable to attend the meetings. Commissioner Hemping stated that the meetings were recorded and to get with Nicole Chesser to get copies.

MINUTES

GREATER NAPLES FIRE RESCUE DISTRICT BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS MEETING June 9, 2015

B. Fire Code Office – Commissioner Cross

Commissioner Cross reported that the District went through with the plan supported by the District attorney to transfer ownership to Greater Naples Fire. There is no closing since the District holds title to the building. He verified with Deputy Director Bishop that Fire Code was funded the whole purchase price plus the amount attributed to the contents. Deputy Director Bishop and Chief Schuldt explained where the information was received from, who reviewed it and how it was calculated. Deputy Director Bishop went over a spreadsheet for the Commissioners which laid out all the numbers and the way the percentages were calculated. All parties involved felt confident with these percentages. The percentages are as follows: North Collier – 54%, 39.38% to Greater Naples, 4.1% to Immokalee, .82% to Ochopee and 1.7% to Isles of Capri.

Commissioner Cross moved to approve staff's recommendation to use those percentages as the makeup of Fire Code. Commissioner Boyer seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0.

1. Fire Code Plan Review Summary of Activity – Deputy Director Bishop Addressed previously.

2. FCO Resolution 2015-10 - Deputy Director Bishop

Deputy Director passed out draft 3 of the resolution with some minor language changes while Commissioner Cross explained with the grumblings heard and after talking to an attorney, with coming up with the percentages, funded the transfer and fund the OPEB trust and in order to distribute along these lines we are going to get everyone that is or was a participant to agree to those numbers and sign a limited release (not yet fully drafted) saying the Districts agree to the closing sheet showing how much cash Fire Code had, adding the \$2.11 million, minus the amount of the OPEB which would leave a balance to be distributed to the Districts in the above mentioned percentages. Before the disbursement, because there could be a dispute or lawsuit, all the Districts are going to have to sign off on the resolution accepting the funds and in exchange everybody releases everybody and the administrative district from any and all claims arising from the Fire Code Office. In essence, if a District does not agree to sign off, it is apparent there will be a dispute and in that case none of the money will get disbursed to anyone and the money will remain with Fire Code. Commissioner Stedman stated that there should be no disputes; the District did the right thing, showing our intent all along where the District could have kept everything.

Commissioner Cross moved to approve Resolution 2015-10 with the caveat authorizing Commissioner Cross to tweak the release language with the lawyer making it a limited release to the Fire Code Office, with all participating districts having to sign off that will be sharing the revenue. Commissioner Boyer seconded the motion. Motion passed 7-1, with Commissioner McMahon opposed.

Chairman Page called a recess at 6:44 PM for a 10 minute break. Chairman Page reconvened at 6:54 PM.

C. Legislative Update- Director Bishop

Director Bishop reported that both bills; 859 and 861 have both passed through the House and Senate and were presented to the Governor on May 26th and he has until June 6th to sign them, veto them or allow them to become law without signature. Letters of support were submitted by the District's counsel.

D. Collier Fire Services Proposal – Chairman Page

Chairman Page updated the Board letting them know that staff put together a fabulous presentation for the proposal to enter into a contract/management agreement with the County. The workshop for the proposal was June 2nd and the District was well represented with staff and the union. The bid packet was followed to the letter and no bid was submitted for the Ochopee area because GNFD felt uncomfortable in bidding Ochopee since it would include Everglades City and the mayor had an issue with the fire district being managed by somebody else previously. The Board was very receptive of everything offered by GNFD, the Board requested GNFD bring back a proposal for everything including Ochopee. The Board did give

GNFD the Isles of Capri portion to manage beginning with 2.0 mils and dropping down to 1.5 mils in the next 2-3 years at which point the District will go to legislation to annex Isles of Capri. The Isles and Ochopee unions were very supportive but the Ochopee union did not want the I-75 station carved out of their district. With District One, GNFD made a proposal to take all of District One but the Board felt it important to keep Ochopee whole but did give permission for GNFD to carve out the areas that GNFD responds to. Commissioner Cross commended Chairman Page on the proposal and reminded him to keep moving forward and keep the discussion on Ochopee open but there is a \$1 million dollar debt to keep in mind. Chairman Page responded by stating that the debt is around \$400,000 and there are PILT funds. Commissioner Boyer stated that it appears that there is alternate funding needed and he suggested cost recovery (charging the insurance companies for calls) which GNFD already have on the books. Chairman Page reminded Commissioner Boyer how the public was not receptive to cost recovery; it was not a popular issue. Chief McLaughlin clarified that the 4.5 mils came from an agreement 3 years ago between the County and the constituents of the District. The District is not upside down and constituents knew to get a fire station the millage would have to be raised. The District does receive PILT money in the amount of \$430,000 - \$530,000 for fire protection. Chief McLaughlin concluded saying everyone is positive with the direction for the fire service professionals working together on something everyone is looking forward to.

III. NEW BUSINESS

A. AIW- Painting Station 23 – Deputy Chief Biondo

Commissioner Cross moved to support staff's recommendation to move forward with approving Blastmasters to paint station 23 in the amount of \$5,790. Commissioner Hemping seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0.

B. AIW - Resolution 2015-08 Impact Fee Rates - Deputy Director Bishop

Commissioner Stedman move to support staff's recommendation for the adoption of Resolution 2015-08 setting the District's Impact Fee rate schedule of twenty-six cents (\$0.26) per square foot for commercial and twenty-two cents (\$0.22) per square foot for residential. Commissioner Hemping seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0. Commissioner Stedman mentioned that new rates reflect a small decrease in what was GGFD's Impact Fee rates.

C. AIW-Golden Gate Estates Land Trust Committee Agreement Amendment – Deputy Director Bishop

Deputy Director presented the amendment to the agreement reminding the Board that this agreement was for the modification and conversion of 2-5 ton military trucks into brush trucks and the paint and modification of 1-5 ton recovery vehicle for a total not to exceed \$150,000. The original agreement was for a twelve month period set to expire on May 27, 2015. The District asked for an extension to complete the work, the revised agreement extends the completion date to July 31, 2016. The County has also changed the name on the agreement to recognize the new district name. Chairman Stedman move to adopt the amended Golden Gate Land Trust Agreement with a new expiration date of July 31, 2016. Commissioner Cottiers seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0.

D. AIW - Resolution 2015-09 Traffic Calming Devices - Fire Marshal Shawn Hanson

Fire Marshal Hanson presented Resolution-2015-09 stating that the District opposes the use of certain traffic calming devices, i.e. speed bumps and speed humps anything that impedes an emergency response and poses an increased risk of injury to responding personnel and damage to district apparatus.

Commissioner Stedman moved to support staff's recommendation by approving Resolution 2015-09 Traffic Calming Devices; thereby opposing the use of speed bumps, speed humps or similar devices within the fire district. Commissioner Boyer seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0.

E. AIW – FY 15-16 Budget Workshop and Hearing Dates

Deputy Director present the proposed dates for the FY 15-16 Budget Workshops and Hearings.

Commissioner Gerrity moved to add to the calendar the workshop dates of August 11th at 3:30 PM and

August 25th at 5:30 PM, and the First Public Hearing date of September 9th at 5:05 PM and the Final Public Hearing date of September 22nd at 5:05 PM. Commissioner Boyer seconded. Motion passed 8-0. Commissioner Gerrity asked whether the board meeting for September could be moved to September 9th, the same night at the First Public Budget Hearing. All commissioners agreed to move the September meeting. Chairman Page asked for all commissioners to be emailed with these new dates.

F. Center for Public Safety Excellence (CPSE): Accreditation Memo – Fire Chief Schuldt
Chief Schuldt stated a goal was to become an accredited agency. In the packet there is a memo with the
background on this accreditation. Staff will be coming to the Board to work on getting this
certification and the Chief anticipates and requests the Board's support on this. The process takes
approximately a minimum of 18 months to complete and the District is not ready at this time but within
the next budget year the District will focus in on this.

Chairman Page added that there are only 129 agencies with this accreditation standard in the world. Collier County EMS and Sheriff's Dispatch center is accredited.

Commissioner Boyer stated that he is worried about the cost; he would like a summary of the cost to get there vs. the savings to our taxpayers; the pros and cons. Is it worth the push? Also, Commissioner Boyer thinks staff's plate is full. Chief Schuldt responded by saying that the cost is \$8000 with an annual renewal fee and some travel expense. Going through this type of process will answer the efficiency and effectiveness questions which will be beneficial to the taxpayers.

Chairman Page told Commissioner Boyer that EMS secured a grant from the State and actually paid an agency to help EMS get there. This might be an option to look at for the District.

G. AIW – Request for Proposal/Qualifications Summary: Benefits Broker, Realtor, Auditor and Impact Fee Study – Deputy Director Bishop

Deputy Director presented the Request for Proposal/ Qualifications Summary.

For auditing services, follow up is needed with several of the companies for the price of the short audit and the Fire Code audit. Staff recommends making the final selection.

For **realtor services**, staff's recommendation is to meet with two of the three companies with proposals for final selection since two of the three companies proposed a flat 6% commission while the third proposed a tiered commissioner depending on the cost of the transaction.

The recommendation for the **benefits broker** is to have the Benefits Committee review all proposals completely since they are so complex and refer to staff and the committee for final selection. Since only one company responded to the **Impact Fee Study** RFP, staff recommends awarding the contract to Tindale – Oliver & Associates in the amount of \$35,060. This company has a proven track record with Collier County and was the company selected for the last Impact Fee Study done in 2005. Commissioner Cross moved to approve staff's recommendation thereby authorizing staff to review and award selection of the auditing, and realtor services and authorize staff and the benefits committee award selection of the benefits broker and further move to award the Impact Fee Study contract to Tindale-Oliver & Associates in the amount of \$35,060. Commissioner Cross also suggested that in all contracts try to negotiate a "not to exceed" fee so the Districts know that the cost will not exceed that cost. Commissioner Boyer seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0.

H. Public Comment

None

I. Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Gerrity attended a seminar held in the City on data driven decisions. Chief Sapp's report has come a long way but it is still far from where the District needs to be. The District is not making data driven decisions. Before the District puts together a strategic plan on buying apparatus or building stations or anything else, this is the number one priority. Some money is going to need to be spent to put together a real package of data to see how the District is being run. Looking at the fractile response times, the District is not a good place to have a cardiac arrest. Commissioner Stedman commented that if you look at the 90% fractile response times, the standard is 5 minutes; 4 minutes for

travel time and 1 minute for turnout. GNFD does not make this standard in any zone and double the standard in most zones and moving forward in this District, this needs to be the number one priority above all else and we need to figure out how to get there faster.

Commissioner Hemping added that this discussion has come up at the Task Force meetings and there might be a partnering to go countywide to hire a firm to help the Districts get where they want to be. Commissioner Stedman stated that this can only be accomplished with agile vehicles, more stations, more personnel and more planning. The District just needs to get there faster. Commissioner Stedman is confident that with the experience that the Chiefs bring and the resources available, this can be done.

Commissioner McMahon began by extending his appreciation to all staff and the firefighters for all they have done and how hard they work, especially those that attended the County Commission Meeting for Isles and Ochopee, good job! Commissioner McMahon went on to say in regard to response times that he has asked about a rapid response station in the estates for years that has fallen on deaf ears. The District needs to take action ourselves, the estates are going to grow and a new city is planned in the next five years. Commissioner McMahon requested an update on the *CPR* RsQ *Assist* since he had not heard anything about them recently. Commissioner Cottlers responded that all vehicles have one. Commissioner Stedman added that he took them to the CCSO.

Commissioner Boyer was thankful response time was brought up and questioned when the response time starts. Chief Sapp responded that it is unit dispatch time to unit arrival scene time. Commissioner Boyer stated that Station 71 is out of line with the rest of the units. Chief Sapp responded that the response time to a call off Desoto can take 18-20 minutes for example. Commissioner Gerrity stated that the District is not getting the turnout time which is information that is completely under the District's control. Commissioner Cross asked Commissioner Gerrity if he would be willing to meet with the Chief and Assistant Chief to find something with the data in such a way that it can be and Assistant Chief to find somethird party vendors to collect the data in such a way that it can be incorporated into the Strategic Plan to make adecision on how to get these times down. Chairman Page stated that that does not need to be done. Commissioner Stedman made a dashboard for him and can dot the activity on a map then you can clearly see where the District is "sucking air". In addition Commissioner, Stedman noted with regard to Commissioner McMahon that he has always supported rapid response things but the problem is by spending money out there when you have deficiencies in much busier zones, you are not making the biggest impact on service. As long as there are response times of 11 minutes to almost 12 minutes in zone 23 building a station in the Estates is not going to help the greatest amount of people.

Chief Schuldt informed the Board that he met with the Sheriff last month and now there are meetings being held on a regular basis with all the public safety agencies to address the challenges faced by each. As a result on the seminar for data driven decisions the next multi agency meeting will focus on a finding a better way to pull data together.

Topics Initiated by the Board of Fire Commissioners J.

None: everything was covered under Commissioner Comments.

SIGNATURE OF BOARD APPROVED ITEMS IV.

- Board Minutes for May 12, 2015 Regular Meeting Resolution 2015-10 Resolution 2015-08 Impact Fee Rates 1.
- 2.
- 3.
- 4. Golden Gate Estates Land Trust Committee Agreement Amendment
- 5. Resolution 2015-09 Traffic Calming Devices

ADJOURNMENT V.

Commissioner McMahon moved to adjourn the meeting at 7:44 PM. Commissioner Stedman seconded the motion. Motion passed 8-0

EXECUTIVE SESSION I.

uly passed with a vote of to and adopted in se	ssion on the 14 th of July 2015)
QAA Pen	fived a bagger
Chairman Jeff Page 7	Commissioner Rob Boyer
Chales (other	abant
Commissioner Charles Cottiers	Commissioner Brian Cross
Commissioner Kevin Gerrity	Commissioner Steve Hemping
Commissioner Chuck McMahon	Commissioner David Stedman Line Commissioner David Stedman Line